

Building in the Promised Land

From the time of his arrival as the minister of Pilgrim Congregational Church in the autumn of 1912, Rev. Charles Nicholas Thorp had a mission. Although Pilgrim's second church building on the corner of Lake Avenue and Second Street was only 24 years old, its congregation was moving from the center of town to new homes in the East End. Between 1905 and 1913, Thorp calculated that the geographic center of the congregation had moved from 7th Avenue East to 16th Avenue East.¹

Pilgrim's substantial stone Lake Avenue building had been constructed near the beginning of a four decade period of remarkable growth. Duluth's population increased from approximately 3,000 in 1880 to nearly 100,000 in 1920. The Lake Avenue location was in Duluth's primary residential community when Pilgrim's second church building was planned, but, within a decade of the time the Lake Avenue building was completed in 1889, Pilgrim was being referred to as a downtown church. Charles Thorp's immediate predecessor at Pilgrim, Rev. Alexander Milne (minister from 1899 to 1911), indicated that he had concerns about Pilgrim's location from the time he first considered coming to Duluth. In his annual report to the congregation for 1906, Milne confided that there are "...serious obstacles to ... successful work in a downtown church and I was not at all anxious to deal with them...the time is yet distant when the present location could be wisely abandoned, nevertheless, the present location is increasingly unfavorable...".²

Charles Thorp was preoccupied with the issue of Pilgrim's location from the beginning of his tenure in Duluth. The need to relocate was not apparent to many given the quality and age of the Lake Avenue building, but Thorp did not feel that Pilgrim had an option.³ He was relentless in his advocacy. The following passage from Charles Thorp's report at the Annual Meeting of January 20, 1914, conveys his argument and intensity.

...One of the heavy anxieties on the mind of your pastor during the year is that our church has been losing valuable time in gripping the biggest problem that confronts us...as I stated a year ago at this meeting...the removal of our church and the

¹ Pilgrim has a 1905 church directory upon the back of which Charles Thorp calculated the geographic center of the congregation in 1905 and 1913.

² Alexander Milne, minister's report prepared for the annual meeting, January 16, 1907.

³ The need for a new building was clearly related to geography rather than the character of the Lake Avenue church. The capacity of the sanctuary of the Lake Avenue church (650 fixed seats on the sloping main floor plus room for another 100 and provision for a balcony which could have seated 250-300) was at least as large as that of the new church (850) which would be built on Fourth Street (although the Fourth Street church would have more a more expansive public area and more classrooms than the Lake Avenue church).

building of a new plant in the East End. The opportunity in the East End will not await our convenience. If another denomination...should show a sign tomorrow on some lot close to 24th Avenue East announcing their intention to build there, Pilgrim Church would be bottled up in its present location and its years of separate life would be numbered. I have pondered this obvious fact as I have walked about what I believe to be our promised land. A similar sign displayed by us in a good size lot would display for us a foothold in a section which ought to be ours, for there our real parish is already located...

Energetic and committed, the popular 42 year old minister⁴ struck a chord which resonated with the congregation. In many ways Charles Thorp was well-prepared for this project. After graduating from Amherst College (1891), he had taught for two years and then entered Yale Divinity School, graduating in 1896. Rev. Thorp had served Congregational churches in Rutland, Vermont (1896-1897), Otswego, New York (1897-1906) and Chelsea, Massachusetts (1906-1912). He must have met his future wife, Susan Long of Rutland (Mount Holyoke College, 1896), during his first pastorate. At Chelsea (part of the Boston metropolitan area), Thorp lead a building project which resulted in the construction of a new \$80,000 church building. He arrived in Duluth with two children, Margaret (7 years old) and Willard L.⁵ (13 years old).

When Charles Thorp arrived with his family, construction projects were underway at two of the other three major churches located in downtown Duluth. The First Presbyterian Church was adding a major addition to their 1891 building, a fateful decision which would anchor them downtown.⁶ St. Paul's Episcopal Church was preparing to leave their 1869 wooden church on the Northwest corner of Lake Avenue and Second Street (cater-

⁴ John Dickerson in his 1961 history notes that Charles Thorp was "...the first minister [at Pilgrim] without a magnificent beard or mustache...".

⁵ Willard would be involved with the founding of Pilgrim's Boy Scout Troop, graduate from Amherst College in 1920, earn a Ph.D. in economics from Columbia University, return to Amherst in 1926 to teach economics, be chosen by Franklin Roosevelt in 1933 to be part of his "brain trust" as Chief of the Bureau of Foreign and Domestic Commerce, serve as Assistant Secretary of State for Economic Affairs under Harry Truman, help draft the Marshall Plan, be the alternate American delegate to the United Nations General Assembly (1947-1948; where he sat between Eleanor Roosevelt and John Foster Dulles) and an economic advisor to Dwight Eisenhower. He was accused by Senator Joseph McCarthy of having "Communist sympathies" and eventually resigned. At the request of Dag Hammarskjold, Willard Thorp headed the United Nations mission to Cyprus in 1960 after the British withdrew from the Island. In 1960, President Kennedy appointed him to head a mission to Bolivia with the rank of ambassador. He died May 10, 1992. We do not have a physical description of Rev. Charles Thorp, but his son was described in Time (August 14, 1933) as being "...tall, chubbily handsome and an able tennis player...".

⁶ First Presbyterian Church's potential for relocation East was hindered by the fact that part of the congregation had already moved East and, in 1905, built the present Glen Avon Presbyterian Church (designed, as Pilgrim's Fourth Street building would be by Frederick German) in the streetcar suburb of Hunter's Park. Farther to the East, Lakeside Presbyterian Church had been founded in 1890.

cornered to Pilgrim's Lake Avenue location) and move to a new building at 17th Avenue East on the Eastern edge of their parish⁷.

It would have been difficult for Pilgrim to relocate to the East End if Morley Congregational Church were still in existence⁸. From 1894 to 1900, Morley Congregational Church held services, as best as I can determine, in the Endion Car House (streetcar barns) on the southeast corner of 20th Avenue East and Superior Street.⁹ In 1900 Morley Church was in a building on the southwest corner of 19th Avenue East and First Street on land which had been purchased by Pilgrim Church in 1893.¹⁰ The relationship between the two churches is obscure. Despite outward signs of support, Pilgrim would have had an inherent (and increasing) conflict of interest with Morley given the fact that congregation of both churches was drawn roughly from the same

⁷ Because of the dramatic growth of city, it was decided to locate an Episcopal Bishop in Duluth. A new Episcopal church, Trinity Pro-Cathedral, was built at 20th Avenue East and Superior Street (on the site of the Endion streetcar barns) for the Bishop, assuming, I imagine, that wealthy Episcopalians building their homes in the East End would transfer to Trinity. This calculation did not take into account the energy and magnetic personality of Rev. Albert W. Ryan, Rector of St. Paul's from 1893 to 1922. Ryan responded by leading a campaign to construct (1911–1912) a far more substantial Church building than Trinity at 17th Avenue East and Superior Street (just west of Trinity and, apparently, as far east as Rev. Ryan could build it). The Episcopalians stayed with St. Paul's Church and Trinity eventually closed. The Trinity building is now Mount Olivet Lutheran Church.

⁸ There were four Congregational Churches in Duluth in the 1890's (Mayflower Congregational Church, New Duluth; Morley Congregational Church; Pilgrim Congregational Church; and Plymouth Congregational Church, southwest corner 54th Avenue West and Bristol Street). Pilgrim was the oldest (organized 1871) and the largest with 380 members in 1900. The others were struggling with fewer than 75 members each.

⁹ The degree of Pilgrim's involvement in the founding of Morley Congregational Church is unclear. In general, Pilgrim appears to have supported the formation of other Congregational churches in the city. On August 15, 1894, Pilgrim representatives Charles E. Lovett and D. H. Claque took part in a Council meeting (called by a group of individuals hoping to form a new church in the Endion neighborhood) with representatives from other regional Congregational churches in the Endion Car House. The purpose of the meeting was to consider the question of forming a new church. The meeting appears to have resulted in the formation of Morley Congregational Church. City directories through 1899 give the address of Morley Congregational Church as the southeast corner of 20th Avenue East and Superior Street (the location of the Endion Car House).

¹⁰ On March 11, 1893, the Board of Trustees of Pilgrim Church approved the purchase of two lots (7 & 8, block 61, Endion Division) on the southwest corner of 19th Avenue East and First Street for \$5,187.50. The purchase appears to have been drawn out and somewhat controversial. On January 29, 1894, the Trustees defeated a motion not to purchase the lots and then voted to proceed with the purchase. It is noted that this took place before formation of the Morley Church. There is no indication that there was a building on the Endion property at the time of the purchase by Pilgrim. In 1900 Morley Church began to hold services in a building on these lots. This was probably not the same building which stands there now. The cornerstone of the present church building on the Endion lots indicates that it was built as the Endion Methodist Episcopal Church in 1909. The building is now (2008) home to the Prince of Peace Fellowship.

geographic area (the Endion neighborhood and areas to the east were being developed when Morley Congregational Church was formed, and most of Pilgrim's congregation would eventually build new homes in these developing neighborhoods). For the first part of its brief existence, Morley Congregational Church was served by Rev. William Whiting Newell. Despite youth¹¹, a distinguished background¹², a young wife¹³ and a growing family¹⁴, Newell was unable to stabilize the young church. He left Duluth before the end of the decade¹⁵ and the Morley congregation voted to disband on January 15, 1902¹⁶.

With Charles Thorp working as he could to move the Pilgrim relocation project forward, two developments occurred in 1914 outside the church organization which were

¹¹ Newell was 27 years old in 1895 (born 1868).

¹² Newell was born in Wappingers Falls, New York, the grandson of Rev. William Whiting Newell (born 1807), said to be the "...the most successful clergyman in New York..." (obituary, New York Times, May 14, 1891, p. 5) who built the Allen Street Presbyterian Church into one of the most prosperous churches in New York City and wrote at least six popular books (one of which was titled Revivals –How and When (1882)). Newell was the son of William Whiting Newell (born 1839), who, after serving Presbyterian parishes in Massachusetts and New York City, moved to Paris where he organized St. Luke's Chapel. He and his wife lived in the center of a large colony of American Students on the Left Bank and died at his home in the Latin Quarter in 1894 (obituary, New York Times, January 26, 1894, p. 3).

¹³ In 1895 Newell married Helen ("Nellie") Bennett.

¹⁴ William and Nellie Newell had two children, William Whiting Newell (born 1896) and Helen Bennett Newell (born 1899).

¹⁵ William Newell served a parish in St. Louis, Missouri, but by 1910 he had moved to the fashionable Chicago suburb of Oak Park where he worked as a minister and secretary of a church association until his death in 1928. Helen did not die until 1959.

¹⁶ On January 14, 1902, William Starkweather Woodbridge (who had been Chairman of the committee to organize Pilgrim Church in 1870 and who donated the windows of the Four Evangelists (originally in the Lake Avenue church) which are in the narthex of Fourth Street Church) and Rev. Alexander Milne (Pilgrim's minister 1899–1911) attended a congregational meeting of Morley Congregational Church and urged the church not to disband. The Morley congregation voted to dissolve their church the following day.

favorable to the project. Norman D. McLeod¹⁷, son-in-law of Charles Duncan (Chairman of Pilgrim's 1914 Building Committee), began talking to two men with deep ties to Pilgrim Church, Ward Ames, Jr.¹⁸ and Julius Barnes¹⁹, about his dream of building a Boy's "Y" in downtown Duluth. Messrs. Ames and Barnes eventually agreed to fund the project, but they needed a building site (and Charles Duncan needed a buyer for Pilgrim's Lake Avenue property). Given the complex and extensive links between Pilgrim Church, the supporters of the Boy's "Y" project and the leadership of the Duluth YMCA, it is not surprising that the needs of Pilgrim and those of the YMCA were considered to be congruent by nearly everyone involved with the new Boy's Y building.²⁰ Pilgrim Congregational Church sold its building on the corner of Lake Avenue and Second Street to the YMCA on September 20, 1915. The YMCA paid \$35,000 cash (provided by Messrs. Ames and Barnes) for the property, with the understanding that Pilgrim would

¹⁷ Much admired, Norman McLeod had an immense reputation in Duluth where he worked with the YMCA. from 1903 to 1949. Born in Ottawa, he came to Duluth in 1903 to serve as the first secretary of the Boy's YMCA. He served as the director of Camp Miller for 46 years and was instrumental in moving the camp to its permanent home on Sturgeon Lake in 1913. He is said to have founded the first Boy Scout program in Duluth in 1910. Many of "Mac's Boys" would later testify to McLeod's seminal example in helping them become one of his "clean-cut, classy lads". Norman McLeod married Grace Duncan in 1911. They lived across the avenue from the future site of Pilgrim at 317 North 23d Avenue East in one of three nearly identical houses built by Charles Duncan for his children as wedding presents (the other two houses are located at 2431 East Sixth Street and 2631 East Fifth Street). True to his Scottish heritage, Norman McLeod was a member of the First Presbyterian Church where he taught Sunday School classes for more than 30 years. When he retired as general secretary of the YMCA in 1949, more than 400 attended a banquet at the Hotel Duluth to pay tribute to Norman McLeod. The keynote speaker that evening was Julius Barnes.

¹⁸ Exactly the same age (both born on February 2, 1873), Barnes moved with his parents to Duluth from Little Rock, Arkansas in 1883 and the Ames family came to Duluth from Oswego, New York three years later. The two men were lifelong friends and sometime business associates in the grain trade.

¹⁹ See postscript at end of paper for biography of Julius Barnes.

²⁰ Six members of Pilgrim were Directors of the YMCA in 1915 (Albert Baldwin, Arthur Barnes, W. G. Hegardt, W. A. McGonagle, S. E. Matter and Oscar Mitchell; these men constituted more than 30% of the membership of the YMCA Board of Directors). Bert C. Wade, a member of Pilgrim Church, was both Executive Director of the YMCA and Secretary of Pilgrim's Building Committee. Norman McLeod, the driving force behind the Boy's "Y" project was the son-in-law of the Chairman of Pilgrim's Building Committee in 1914 (Charles Duncan). Most significantly, the two men who funded the entire Boy's "Y" project, Ward Ames, Jr. and Julius Barnes, were associated with Pilgrim Church. Ward Ames, Sr. had been, until his death in 1912, the most significant single patron of Pilgrim Church. Ward Ames, Jr. and his family would donate the original organ for the new building on Fourth Street in memory of Ward Ames, Sr.. Julius Barnes' parents, Lucien (d. 1890) and Julia (d. 1930), as well as his brother Arthur and his sister Henrietta (Mrs. Edwin D.) Field (her husband and his family are commemorated by the Field Memorial Window in Pilgrim's sanctuary), were active members of Pilgrim Church from the time they arrived in Duluth in 1883. Julia put great effort into assembling a portrait book of early Pilgrim's for the Church's 25th anniversary (1896). Julius Barnes purchased a Tiffany window for the Fourth Street Church building in memory of his parents.

remove anything it wanted and demolish the old church building to ground level.²¹ The sale price was surprisingly high thanks to the generosity of Julius Barnes and his desire to acquire a suitable location downtown which could be developed immediately.²²

A second favorable development occurred on June 14, 1914, when several lots on the corner of 23d Avenue East and Fourth Street were quietly purchased with \$8,000 put up by eight members of Pilgrim Church: Charles Duncan²³; Oscar Mitchell²⁴; William G.

²¹ When completed in 1889 (26 years earlier), the total cost of the Lake Avenue Church had been \$55,828.33. Demolition of the Church in 1915 cost \$2,375.58. Watson S. Moore, chairman of the YMCA Board of Directors, made the offer to buy Pilgrim's Lake Avenue building in a letter to Oscar Mitchell dated August 11, 1915 which stated that as a "...result of informal conferences between individual members of the Church and directors of the [Young Men's Christian] Association it was agreed that the ... proposition would be considered equitable and likely to be accepted by the Church...".

²² Bert Wade (Executive Director of the YMCA and Secretary of Pilgrim's Building Committee) wrote to Oscar Mitchell on August 13, 1915, that "...we are constantly having to explain why we pay so much for the site. It is very easy to make the explanation on account of Barnes' contribution but it would be impossible as being a reasonable price for the ground. For instance, Mr. Styker thinks it would be worth less than \$25,000...Mr. Barnes' proposition, as stated to Mr. Moore and Mr. Hegardt was based absolutely on getting, I think he used the word, "immediate" possession in order that work could proceed as fast as plans could be made...."

²³ Charles Abner Duncan had broad business interests which extended well beyond the original family logging enterprise started by his father David A. Duncan (Duncan and Brewer Lumber Company). He was also President of the American Carbolite Company (located in West Duluth, it employed 300 and manufactured carbolite used to make acetelyne gas for lighting) and the Great Northern Power Company (an early electric company which generated electricity at a hydroelectric plant on the St. Louis River). His home (built in 1906) was located near Pilgrim at 2215 East Second Street.

²⁴ Oscar Mitchell sat on Pilgrim's Board of Trustees from 1900 to 1937 and was its Chairman for almost all of that time. During his tenure, Church finances were much improved (for which Mitchell credited W. G. Hegardt), the new Fourth Street Building was built and the Church experienced a sizeable expansion of its membership. Mitchell was counsel to a number of the largest corporations in Duluth and was a partner of Jed L. Washburn and W. D. Bailey (Washburn, Bailey and Mitchell, later Mitchell, Gillette, Nye and Harries). In 1924 he would build a stylish home little more than one block from Pilgrim (2516 East Fifth Street).

Hegardt²⁵; Ward Ames, Jr.²⁶; Samuel Matter

²⁵ William Gustav Hegardt was a trustee of Pilgrim Church from 1903 to 1926. He was an officer and eventually President of the American Exchange Bank. He and his friend Charles Duncan died within two years of each other and share a Tiffany window. W. G. Hegardt was Chairman of the Finance Committee of Pilgrim's Board of Trustees for more than 20 years. In a tribute to William Hegardt at the time of his death (9/22/1926), Oscar Mitchell described Hegardt's contribution to Pilgrim: "...When we became associated with the Board of Trustees the Church owned the old building on Lake Avenue and First heavily encumbered by mortgage and the pastor's salary was sadly in arrears. These matters were corrected: the pastor's salary was paid, the church mortgage discharged and later this beautiful building erected, equipped and dedicated free of debt and through it all ran the quiet persistent influence of Mr. Hegardt always giving of time and money in the fullest measure and always insisting on business methods in conducting the business affairs of the church...to him as much as to any other man is due the fact that for twenty years at each annual meeting the Trustees have been able to report all bills paid..."

²⁶ Ward Ames, Jr. was the partner of Julius Barnes in the Barnes-Ames Company of Duluth, Winnipeg and New York City, grain brokers and exporters. He also was one of the founders of the McDougall-Duluth Shipyards. He was the son of Ward (Wardwell) Ames, Sr. and Clara Strong Ames, successful grain broker major benefactor of the YMCA, Pilgrim Congregational Church and other charities. Ward Ames, Jr.'s first wife, Maude White died in 1915 (she was the daughter of William and Margaret White; William White was an owner of the Patton White Company (later the Glass Block)). In 1908, Ward and Maude Ames built their home across the street from the Duncans at 2216 East Second Street (presently (2017) the home of Anne Whitworth and David Kirby). In 1917, Ward Ames, Jr. married Helen Mattocks Spencer Miller, who was: 1) the daughter of George and Helen Spencer (George was a central figure in the grain trade from its inception at the Head of the Lakes and was a founder of the Duluth Board of Trade; he was Pilgrim's first clerk (1871); George and Helen Spencer lived next door to the Ames' at 2230 East Second Street); and 2) widow of Athol Morton Miller (the only son of one of Duluth's most successful and enigmatic businessmen, Andreas Mitchell Miller (who in the same year, 1892, built one of the most important buildings ever built in Duluth, the Lyceum Theater, and the first luxury hotel on the corner of 5th Avenue and Central Park South in New York City, the Savoy Hotel)). Ward and Helen Ames made their home at 1618 Vermilion Road (now the Leek residence). The Ames' wintered and eventually lived in Palm Beach, Florida (where Mr. Ames was a Director of the *Bath and Tennis Club*, *Everglades Club* and *Old Guards' Club*). He is said to have been one of the founders (and club golf champion) of Northland Country Club. The Ames' also spent time on the Brule River (Winnebijou Club) and Isle Royale (Washington Club). Ward Ames died in Palm Beach in 1962 at the age of 89. He was survived by two daughters: Miss Margaret Dale Ames and Mrs. John S. Wilbur.

²⁷; Robert B. Whiteside²⁸; Albert Baldwin²⁹; A. W. Frick³⁰; and William A. McGonagle

²⁷ Samuel E. Matter became a member of Pilgrim in 1898. His brother Elmer had joined the Church in 1882. Samuel was the President of Standard Salt and Cement. Samuel, Elmer and their wives were all graduates of Oberlin College. Samuel and Anna built one of the early homes in Hunter's Park at 2132 Woodland Avenue. They had one child, Katherine, who married Arthur Roberts. The large window at the front of the Fourth Street church sanctuary which celebrates Congregational contributions to education is a memorial to Arthur Roberts' two wives, Katherine Matter (Oberlin College, 1922) and Mary McGonagle Tibbetts (Mount Holyoke College). The Roberts' window has schematic images of buildings located on the campus of Oberlin College, Mount Holyoke College, Harvard University, Yale University, Fisk University and Northland College.

²⁸ Robert Whiteside made a fortune logging and mining in Northeastern Minnesota. He subsequently invested heavily in mining and oil enterprises (including land which became part of the largest oil field in Texas) throughout North America. He owned thousands of acres of ancient Sequoia trees in the Sierra Nevada Mountains of California and for years resisted attempts to make his holdings, one of the largest stands of sequoias in California, into a national park. Despite the fears of many in California, Whiteside kept the stand of Sequoias intact (although he cut a few of the smaller trees for woodwork in his mansion at Fourth Avenue East and Third Street, now demolished, which stood on the site of the present St. Ann's Home; see "Unique home for rich man; giant sequoias from Calaveras Grove to be utilized", New York Times, January 25, 1903, page 25). Robert Whiteside's Sequoia groves in California now form the Calaveras Big Trees State Park.

²⁹ Albert Baldwin was an attorney who practiced with his older brother Charles. Their law firm continues today (2008), the oldest law firm in northern Minnesota, as Johnson, Killen and Seiler. Rev. Noble Strong Elderkin (in many ways prototypic of qualities much admired at Pilgrim), minister from 1921 to 1930, returned to Duluth and delivered an eulogy for Albert Baldwin at the time of his death (12/6/1952). "...Mr. Baldwin was the last of that group of remarkable young men who, when Ward Ames died [1912], resolved to try to take his place and do for Pilgrim Church...what Ward Ames was intent upon doing...few churches are ever so fortunate to have such a group giving such full devotion over so long a period of years...they gave thoughtfully and hopefully and generously – bent upon making Pilgrim Church a useful agency at every possible turn...Only deeds could speak. And what deeds they ordered to speak for them!"

³⁰ Alfred Wilson Frick was the brother-in-law of Charles Duncan. He was the manager of the van Dusen-Harrington grain trading company. He built his home at 2231 East Second Street (once owned by Peggy and Steve Downing) next door to the home of his Mother-in-Law (Julia Duncan) and two doors from the much larger home of his Brother-in-Law (Charles Duncan). Alfred and Franc Frick's daughter Virginia married Howard Manley who would become President of the Manley-McLennan Agency (originally founded by Howard's father and associates as Stryker, Manley and Buck, the agency was headed for many years by Donald R. McLennan, even after he had moved to Chicago and founded, with Henry W. Marsh, what is now (2008) the one of the largest (57,000 employees) insurance companies in the United States, Marsh & McLennan Companies (MMC)). Virginia and Howard Manley lived near the Church at 2222 East Fourth Street. Virginia worked at Pilgrim Church in various positions for three decades, most prominently as the long-time church secretary.

³¹. The lots were held in the names of William and Jessie Hegardt. An agreement was signed which dictated that, if Pilgrim Church did not use this property within five years, the Hegardts' would hold the property in trust for those who put up the money.

Pilgrim Church hired Frederick German, an architect much favored by wealthy Duluthians at the height of his popularity, to design their new building.³² He was also chosen to design the new Boy's Y.M.C.A. building. He charged the same fee for both buildings, 4% of construction cost.³³ German first met with the Building Committee (Samuel Matter, Chairman) on August 17, 1915 and presented a list of materials which could be salvaged from the Lake Avenue Church³⁴. At that meeting, the committee passed a motion (made by A. W. Frick) that Frederick German prepare sketches for "... a church and parish house to cost complete not more than \$100,000.00..." German appears to have initially favored a colonial design for the new church. On September 13,

³¹ A native of Pennsylvania (born 1861) and a graduate engineer of the University of Pennsylvania (1881), William Albert McGonagle came to Minnesota in 1881. He was President of the Duluth, Missabe and Northern Railroad for 21 years, but was remembered most for his leadership in civic affairs. He headed at one time or another most of the civic organizations in the city. He was in charge of relief efforts for the 1918 fire. He was responsible for local arrangements for Calvin Coolidge's travel in northern Minnesota during the Summer of 1928 when the Summer White House was at the Brule. He was one of the five founders of the Minnesota Mining and Manufacturing Company (3M) when it was established in Two Harbors in 1902. Two Great Lakes ships were named after William McGonagle, a 110 foot fire tug (which sailed from 1908 to 1966) and a brawny 600 foot freighter. Regarded by many as one of the most beautiful ships ever to sail the Great Lakes, the William A. McGonagle sailed from 1916 to 1986 when she was sold and renamed the Henry Steinbrenner. She was scrapped in 1994. Although William died in 1930, his widow Sarah Sargent McGonagle (Mount Holyoke College) continued to live in their Hunter's Park home (9 East Oxford Street) until her death in 1945. His daughter Mary was a long-time presence at Pilgrim Church as the wife of orthopedic surgeon Mark Hopkins Tibbetts (married 1923), as a young widow and mother, and later in life as the second wife of Arthur Roberts. Mary died in 1997 at the age of 99.

³² Frederick German designed a number of houses lived in by Pilgrims, e.g.: Ward and Helen Ames, 1618 Vermillion Road (once owned by Joseph and Francis Leek); William and Emilie Cole, 2204 East First Street (once owned by Sheralyn and Mike Zlonis; in 1909, William and Emilie Cole's previous home at 1131 East First Street (now demolished) became Pilgrim's manse, financed, in part, with major gifts from Ward Ames, Sr. and William Cole); the present (2008) home of Gene and Jane Shull, 314 Hawthorne Road (previously the G. Ashley Tomlinson and Marshall W. Alworth residence). German also designed Glen Avon Presbyterian Church in 1905.

³³ Very little restraint was exercised in the design and construction of the Boy's Y. Julius Barnes and Ward Ames, Jr. were committed to giving the city the finest building for young men in the country.

³⁴ The builders ended up reusing some of the stone from the old church for the foundation of the new church, some of the slate from the roof, windows of the Four Evangelists given by William Starkweather Woodbridge in memory of Rev. Jonathan Edwards Woodbridge (these windows were made in Paris and signed J. B. Anglade, 1888; purchase of the windows was arranged by the talented landscape painter Gilbert Munger (www.gilbertmunger.com) who was living in Paris at the time and whose brother Roger had been associated with Pilgrim from the earliest days of the church), and the window now in the ceiling of the chapel given as a memorial by Mr. and Mrs. Roger Munger in memory of their son.

1915, he presented the Building Committee with preliminary sketches for a colonial church. These were discussed and referred back to the architect.

The last Sunday service was held in the Lake Avenue church on September 19, 1915. Pilgrim then moved across Lake Avenue to hold Sunday morning services for the next two years in the auditorium of the Masonic Temple.³⁵ Arrangements were made to hold Christian Endeavor (C.E.) meetings for young people, Sunday evening Vesper services, and Thursday mid-week (prayer) meetings at the First Unitarian Church.³⁶ The Unitarian Church, at the southeast corner of 18th Avenue East and First Street, was in a charming, but very small building which had been designed by Anthony Puck.³⁷ The small Unitarian sanctuary was adequate for Pilgrim's Sunday evening and Thursday services. It is not difficult to find references to poor attendance at all church services, especially Sunday Vespers and the Midweek service. Henrietta Field³⁸ recalled that Alexander Milne (minister from 1899 to 1911) had a hard time convincing people to come to the midweek service. He thought that Ward Ames, Sr. should set an example. Ames agreed to attend some of the midweek meetings on the condition that Milne would never call on him.³⁹ Charles Thorp humorously accepted less than optimal attendance during 1914 by saying "...knowing the preacher as well as I do, I have been surprised by the attendance maintained throughout the year..."⁴⁰ Two years later, Charles Thorp proposed moving the midweek service from Thursday to Wednesday, because housemaids and cooks traditionally have Thursday evening off.⁴¹ Thorp thought this made it inconvenient for women to attend the midweek service.⁴² Even during a period of great buoyancy at Pilgrim, the charismatic Noble Elderkin (minister from 1920 to 1930) would report that

³⁵ The cornerstone of the Masonic Temple had been laid on August 10, 1904 by long-time Pilgrim member and Masonic Grand Master, William A. McGonagle.

³⁶ Pilgrim archives has a letter dated November 8, 1915 from W. B. Brinkman, President of the Board of Trustees of the First Unitarian Church to W. G. Hegardt, Treasurer of both Pilgrim and its Building Committee, outlining the parameters of use and defining a monthly rent of \$100. It is noted that W. B. Brinkman worked for the George A. Gray Company (a department store which later became Wahl's), and that George A. Gray was a member (deacon, trustee) of Pilgrim Church.

³⁷ This building is now (2008) a meeting house for the Religious Society of Friends.

³⁸ Henrietta Barnes Field was the widow of Edwin D. Field (successful real estate investor memorialized with a Tiffany window) and the older sister of Julius Barnes.

³⁹ Recollections of Mrs. E. D. Field at the 75th Anniversary of Pilgrim Congregational Church, January 18, 1946.

⁴⁰ Annual Report of the Minister, January 1, 1915.

⁴¹ The Kitchi Gammi Club was filled with families dining on Thursdays for the same reason.

⁴² Annual Report of the Minister, January 16, 1917.

“...the percentage of our membership that had habits of regular attendance [during 1922] was outrageously small...”⁴³

The Building Committee met again with Frederick German on December 17, 1915, at the manse (1131 East First Street). German brought plans and elevations for three proposed churches. The committee selected floor plan #1 and requested that German do exterior drawings in both colonial and gothic style. The committee met three weeks later (1/18/1916) in Charles Duncan’s office. Both Frederick German and his partner Lief Jenssen were present with a new set of plans for a building estimated to cost \$90,000.00. On July 18, 1916, meeting in Charles Duncan’s home (2215 East Second Street), the Building Committee discussed recently opened bids for the new building. The bids ranged from \$104,584 (Lounsberry) to \$132,900 (Bowe-Burke). The contract was awarded to George H. Lounsberry (who lived near the new church at 2102 East Third Street and who was just finishing construction of Morgan Park for U. S. Steel). A number of changes were made to the plans (including removal of tracery from many windows, not flooring the attic, not building the alley walkway out of stone, etc.) which reduced the contract price to \$103,209. The construction contract with George Lounsberry was signed July 24, 1916.

Frederick German was concerned about the deletions. On September 28, 1916, he wrote to the Building Committee to state that “...omission [of stone tracery at a savings of about \$1,500] is a very serious blemish architecturally and I feel sure will be a matter of great regret and disappointment to you all. The windows are large and conspicuous, some 9 feet wide and 10 feet high, and, as tracery is, perhaps, the most recognize single feature of Gothic architecture, its omission will be a subject of just criticism, and I am sure that steps will be taken very shortly to remedy this defect, if not done now...the cost later will be over \$3,000...” On the same day, German also wrote to express his approval of the substitution of 2 1/4” clear fir flooring (which Mr. Lounsberry had on hand) in the sanctuary in lieu of the soft pine which had been originally specified.

The cornerstone for the new Church was laid on October 22, 1916. Charles Thorp’s comments at the cornerstone ceremony give some perspective on the scope of the project: “The erection of such an extensive building, much larger than the needs of the present congregation ... is a notable act of faith in the growth of this city and the future enlargement of our work.” Pilgrim had 430 members in 1913 when Charles Thorp began aggressively promoting a new church building. At the end of 1919, two years after completion of the new church building, Pilgrim’s membership had grown 126 to 556.

In the early planning stages, the Building Committee had hoped that the new building could be occupied the first day of February 1917, but the first Sunday service in the new building was not held until September 30, 1917.

As construction neared completion, the Building Committee worked to tie up loose ends. Charles Duncan, who stood out as a leader throughout the project (even though he was

⁴³ Annual Report of the Minister, January 16, 1923.

not Chairman of the Building Committee after 1914), was determined to raise enough money to pay off all debts before the formal church dedication service on December 23, 1917. We are fortunate to have a telegram he sent to Oscar Mitchell in Chicago, two days before the dedication service, which conveys the sense of responsibility and pride he and others must have felt for the project.

OSCAR MITCELL
BLACKSTONE HOTEL
CHICAGO

NINE THOUSAND DOLLARS⁴⁴ REQUIRED TO DEDICATE CHURCH FREE OF DEBT AND PAY ALL BILLS TO JANUARY FIRST CONDITIONED UPON FULL AMOUNT BEING RAISED MATTER AND I WILL GIVE FIFTEEN HUNDRED⁴⁵ EACH BALDWIN HEGARDT AMES AND WHITESIDE ONE THOUSAND EACH I WANT YOUR AUTHORITY TO SAY YOU WILL ALSO GIVE ONE THOUSAND AND WE WILL GET ENOUGH TO CLEANUP EVERYTHING INCLUDING MASONIC GIFT⁴⁶ LET US DO THE JOB RIGHT WIRE IN YOUR OK AT ONCE NECESSARY

C A DUNCAN
4:53 PM
DULUTH

Charles Duncan was successful, and a festive dedication service was held on the Sunday before Christmas 1917. The dedicatory sermon was preached by the 37 year old President of Carleton College, Dr. Donald Cowling⁴⁷.

With his church built and his children nearly grown, Rev. Charles Nicholas Thorp submitted his resignation, effective October 20, 1919. He and Susan moved to Holyoke, Massachusetts, a location attractive to them because it was near their undergraduate colleges and their children (Willard was at Amherst). Albert Baldwin wrote the following insightful resolution (9/23/1919) accepting Charles Thorp's resignation.

⁴⁴ This represents approximately 6% of the total cost of the church and furnishings (\$157,016.08).

⁴⁵ \$1,500 in 1917 is estimated to have the buying power of more than \$24,000 in 2008.

⁴⁶ Pilgrim gave the Masonic Temple a clock "...as a mark of appreciation for their generous hospitality in furnishing to the church, without charge, for two years, the use of their building, equipment and organ..."

⁴⁷ Donald J. Cowling, B.A., M.A., B.D. and Ph.D. (all from Yale) was the President of Carleton College from 1909 to 1945. Only 29 when he came to Carleton, Dr. Cowling did much during his tenure to enhance the stature and visibility of the college. He visited Pilgrim a number of times (particularly during the first part of his presidency) and (directly and indirectly) solicited financial support for Carleton (in some ways Pilgrim's relationship with Carleton College in the first portion of the last century is analogous with its more recent relationship with Northland College).

“...He came to office with a fine enthusiasm and a broad optimism that has been a dominant characteristic of his seven years ministry among us.

For several years before his coming there had been a somewhat dormant sentiment in the Church that for its most effective work Pilgrim Church must seek a new home in the Eastern part of the city. This sentiment did not begin to crystallize into action until Mr. Thorp, with characteristic zeal, made a careful canvas of the situation. Within a few weeks after beginning his pastorate he made a map of the parish showing the location of each family and thus demonstrated that the center of the Church's population was sixteen blocks east of the then location of the Church building. He then brought the subject before the Church at its annual meeting in January, 1913, setting forth in detail the results of his investigations and concluding his report as pastor with a recommendation and a prophecy; a recommendation that the costs of a new building be investigated and a purchaser sought for the old site, and a prophecy that by 1915, Pilgrim Church would be conducting its services from a center between Sixteenth and Twenty-fourth Avenues East. From that day his effort to fill what he was convinced was the supreme need of Pilgrim Church was not slackened until on Christmas day 1917, there was dedicated free of debt this church and parish house, a plant unsurpassed in strategic location, in architectural beauty and in working equipment by any church of the Northwest...”

Postscript: Julius Howland Barnes' life was characterized by remarkable achievement, extraordinary generosity, exemplary public service and bad luck. Barnes dropped out of high school (10th Grade) after only two months (his father died in 1890) and went to work as an office boy for the Ames-Brooks grain trading firm (headed by Ward Ames, Sr.). He eventually became wealthy on the trading floor of the Duluth Board of Trade. He was a partner or sole owner of many business enterprises: Barnes-Ames Company (with Ward Ames, Jr.; Barnes-Ames was at one time the largest grain exporter in the world, operating elevators and ships with offices in Duluth, New York and Winnipeg); Barnes-Duluth Shipbuilding Company and Barnes-McDougal Shipyard (with Alexander McDougal, Chester Congdon, Marshall Alworth and Ward Ames, Jr.; the shipyards and housing formed the community of Riverside where Barnes made a disciplined effort to hire men with families who were out of work; 36 freighters were built at the Riverside shipyard during World War I); Klearflax Looms (founded by Julius Barnes in 1909 as the Western Linen Company, Barnes eventually built a 117,800 square foot six storey building on Grand Avenue and employed over 300 workers, using flax grown in Meadowlands and Port Wing, to make custom carpets designed by the company's textile design department (Barnes was a champion (and putative “father”) of “chemurgy” (the science of converting products of the soil to new uses)); Erie and St. Lawrence Corporation; Intercontinental Development Company; Pitney-Bowes Postage Meter Corporation (Chairman of the Board of Directors); General Bronze Corporation; Washington Herald (owner and publisher); and American Industries, Inc.. Julius Barnes married Harriet Carey in 1896. The couple built a Spanish Colonial house in 1906 at 25 South 26th Avenue East (they also maintained a residence in New York City but considered Duluth to be their home). Barnes owned the first private aircraft in Duluth (1913) named Lark of the Lakes. Julius Barnes was the main guiding force and principal patron of the Duluth Boat Club (which he joined in 1900). He led the project to construct a new club house (with dormitories for the rowing team, dining rooms for club members and an Olympic size swimming pool) at Tenth Street

on Park Point. Barnes was particularly interested in rowing. As a young man, he was a member of a four man championship rowing crew. In 1911, Barnes hired James Ten Eyck, Jr. (one of the world's finest scullers, son of the great rowing coach at Syracuse University and the U.S. Naval Academy, and brother of Edward H. Ten Eyck (who was the first American to win rowing's highest honor, the Diamond Sculls at the Royal Henley Regatta in 1897) to coach the Duluth rowing team. With training costs and traveling expenses largely paid by Julius Barnes, Duluth crews won 47 of 58 races and 20 national championships between 1911 and 1923. Walter Hoover of Duluth won the Diamond Sculls at Henley-on-Thames in 1922. When James Ten Eyck, Jr. was said to be leaving Duluth, The New York Times reported (May 21, 1918) that James Ten Eyck, Sr. had resigned as head coach at Syracuse University to become coach at Duluth (as best as I can tell, neither of the resignations ever took effect, but the fact that this story was reported suggests that Duluth had credibility as an absolutely first-class, well-financed program). Herbert Hoover, Jr. (later Undersecretary of State during the Eisenhower administration) lived for a summer at the Barnes' home while training with the Duluth rowing team. During World War I, Julius Barnes was President of the U.S. Food Administration Grain Corporation, set up by Herbert Hoover to control food shipments to Europe. Millions were fed, more than eight billion dollars of grain was purchased for the program without (as Calvin Coolidge would write in a tribute to Barnes) "...a single charge of irregularity." After World War I, he received the highest civilian honors from six European countries which had benefited from the relief efforts. In 1920, Barnes paid the entire cost of (\$160,000 (more than the entire cost of the Fourth Street Pilgrim Church building with furnishings)) of constructing a new Y.M.C.A. building in West Duluth (Barnes' support for the Duluth Y.M.C.A. may have been inspired by his participation in Y.M.C.A. programs; in 1891, he won a Y.M.C.A. award for being the best all around athlete). Julius Barnes was President of the U.S. Chamber of Commerce 1921-1924 and Chairman of its Board of Directors 1929-1931. President Hoover appointed Barnes in 1929 to head the National Survey Business Conference in an attempt to rally the nation's industrial forces to prevent a prolonged economic downturn. Julius Barnes was on the cover of the May 5, 1930 edition of Time magazine. Barnes is said to have lost the bulk of his fortune in 1929. During the last part of his life he championed the Great Lakes deep waterway, and "...for 35 years ...was one of...[the]...strongest and most consistent proponents..." of the St. Lawrence Seaway. Although he left school in 10th Grade, Julius Barnes was an avid reader, "prolific writer...and...persuasive public speaker". He received honorary degrees from Harvard University, Dartmouth College, University of Pittsburgh and Syracuse University. "In 1921, he was made an honorary member of Phi Beta Kappa at the College of William and Mary. Julius Barnes wife Harriet died in 1957. During the last years of his life, he lived alone in a single cheap hotel room in Downtown Duluth. On April 29, 1958, he gave his foreign decorations as well as his prized 1891 Y.M.C.A. "all around" athlete award and his championship rowing award to the St. Louis County Historical Society. During the 1950's, he appears to have had to rely on the charity of friends. Beginning in 1953, he signed a series of \$1,000 notes (payable on demand without interest). After Barnes death Herbert Hoover and others filed a claim on Julius Barnes' estate in an attempt to recover the money they had loaned him. On April 17, 1959, Julius Howland Barnes was found dead (age 86 years) in his small room at the Holland Hotel (located at 5th Avenue West and Superior Street in a part of town which would be torn down in a few years for urban renewal). He had a simple service at Crawford Mortuary Chapel. The Duluth News-Tribune (4/21/1959) reported that "...Mr. Barnes' minister, Dr. William Halfaker of Pilgrim Congregational Church...[could not conduct the service] ...Dr. Halfaker is in Miami Beach, Florida, attending an executive committee meeting of the board of directors of the Home Missions Board of the Congregational Christian Church...". Julius Barnes was buried (4/20/1959) next to his wife, Harriet (buried 5/27/1957) in Forest Hill Cemetery, Duluth (Section M, Block 4, Lot 29, Graves 1 and 2). The graves of Julius and Harriet are unmarked. They do not have headstones or a monument.